Experiences of Racism & 'Race' in Schools in Wales

A Collaborative Paper by Ethnic Minorities & Youth Support Team Wales, Show Racism the Red Card, Race Council Cymru, Tros Gynnal Plant.

Report Authors: Ginger Wiegand and Rocio Cifuentes

With additional contributions from: Sunil Patel, Trudy Aspinwall, Mrs. Uzo Iwobi

March 2018

Ethnic Minorities & Youth Support Team All Wales BAME Engagement Programme Research Report Series

Contents

Section One: Introduction

Wales' Well Being of Future Generations Act places a legal duty on all public bodies in Wales to think about the long-term impact of their decisions, to work better with people, communities and each other, and to prevent persistent problems such as poverty, health inequalities and climate change. The Act specifies seven Wellbeing goals, towards which all public bodies must work, of which two are 'A more equal Wales' and 'A Wales of cohesive communities'.

With education being a devolved matter in Wales, schools and local authorities fall under the scope of the Future Generations Act. Furthermore, the new schools curriculum being developed in Wales, following the Donaldson report, has as one of its four core purposes that 'All of our children and young people will be ethical and informed citizens... who respect the needs and rights of others as members of a diverse society' (http://gov.wales/docs/dcells/publications/151021-a-curriculum-for-wales-poster.pdf)

Both the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act and the new Schools Curriculum align in their vision that Wales needs active, engaged and ethical citizens who can contribute to a more sustainable, more equal and more cohesive Wales, and that a quality education system is central to achieving this. Thus, we have a unique opportunity as well as a legal duty in Wales to adequately address theses issues.

With ethnic minority pupils in Wales accounting for more than 10% of children in Wales' schools and 32% of children in Cardiff schools, adequately meeting the needs of these pupils will be essential in achieving this vision.

At the same time as ethnic diversity is increasing in Wales and the UK, there is an "overriding view" that race and race-related issues are at the margins of the current political agenda – a view argued by Race and Lander in their edited collection on ethnicity and education[1]. This paper seeks to illuminate how issues of race and ethnicity are affecting ethnic minority children in Wales, particularly within the schools setting.

The following paper is situated within the perspective of critical race theory (CRT)[2]. CRT proposes that there is an established racial hierarchy that advantages certain parts of society (white people), and racialises and disadvantages others (people of colour, people determined to be insufficiently "white"). Racism thus exists at the institutional, social, and governmental level, and it is both conscious and unconscious, but most importantly, pervasive. This pronounces the need to adequately and openly discuss how race is addressed within our education system; and how education impacts on young people of diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds.

Thirty years ago, the Swann report, "Education for All," called for equity in education and referred to a need for curriculums that reflect the ethnic diversity of students. It noted classroom bias against particular ethnic minority groups and called for all teachers to be trained in teaching to ethnically diverse classrooms. Many current researchers lament that, 30 years on from the Swann report, we are still making those same demands.

This paper is one more push to open that debate. We focus on issues of racism in schools, educational attainment and diversity in the curriculum. We underline the argument for:

- Specific requirements for regular anti-racist education throughout key stages and robust monitoring of racist bullying and incidents in schools;
- An authentically diverse curriculum;
- Teachers being trained in a) cultural competence, the skills to reflect on their own identity and privilege and how that may affect pupils; b) to recognise and respond effectively to racism and c) to develop authentic diversity in curriculums;
- Increasing the representation of BAME teachers and employees at all levels of the education system.

Definition of Key Terms

Racism: Racism refers to a wide range of social disadvantages faced by people racialised as belonging to a non-white ethnic grouping. They may range from violent hate crimes, to offensive comments, to more subtle forms of discrimination in the job market, to negative treatment. Our understanding of race derives heavily from Critical Race Theory (see definition), and as such as includes the general prescription that racism is primarily "prejudice plus power".

Critical Race Theory (CRT): The view that race, instead of being biologically grounded and natural, is socially constructed and that race, as a socially constructed concept, functions as a means to maintain the interests of the white population that constructed it. According to CRT, racial inequality emerges from the social, economic, and legal differences that white people create between "races" to maintain elite white interest in labour markets and politics and as such create the circumstances that give rise to poverty and criminality in many minority communities. For an overview of critical race theory and its origins see Crenshaw, Kimberlé; Gotanda, Neil; Peller, Gary; Thomas, Kendall, eds. (1995). Critical Race Theory: The Key Writings that Formed the Movement. New York: The New Press. ISBN 978-1-56584-271-7.

Islamophobia: The term Islamophobia was first popularised by the Runneymede Trust in 1997 to discuss the specific ways in which Muslims in Britain were disadvantaged. The term has emerged as the most common term to describe the racisms and disadvantage faced by Muslims, although other terms such as "anti-Muslim sentiment/prejudice/racism" have been proposed. A definition of Islamophobia offered by the University of Berkeley is reproduced below: -

> *Islamophobia is a contrived fear or prejudice fomented by the existing Eurocentric and Orientalist global power structure. It is directed at a perceived or real Muslim threat through the maintenance and extension of existing disparities in economic, political, social and cultural relations, while rationalizing the necessity to deploy violence as a tool to achieve "civilizational rehab" of the target communities (Muslim or otherwise). Islamophobia reintroduces and reaffirms a global racial structure through which resource distribution disparities are maintained and extended.*

A key aspect of the definition is the way in which Muslims are targeted by policies, structures, and disadvantages, effectively racializing them. There is therefore a strong overlap between Islamophobia and racism in how they operate (and with a significant crossover in terms of the majority of British Muslims being from a BAME community; and around two thirds of BAME people in Wales also being Muslim).

BAME: The acronym BAME students for Black, Asian, and Minority Ethnic. It is used alternatively with BAME (Black and Minority Ethnic) and "person(s) of colour (POC)" to denote non-white identities and ethnicities. Racism is targeted at communities and identities perceived to be excluded from the mainstream on the basis of a real or perceived racial, ethnic, religious or social difference.

Gypsy, Roma, Traveller (GRT): A broad term to refer to a number of diverse communities across the United Kingdom and Wales, whose unique socio-economic positions means they are often overlooked in traditional BAME programmes (despite being a minority ethnic community).

A note on the use of the terms **BAME** and **Ethnic Minority** in this paper: We use these terms to refer to people with BAME heritage and people in GRT communities as well as EU citizens living in the UK (who are of multiple races, including White, but whom also experience some of the same marginalisation and discrimination as BAME and GRT communities).

Section Two: Demographic Context in Wales: Pupils & Teachers

Wales is becoming an increasingly ethnically diverse nation and the percentage of population who do not describe themselves as White British rose to 4% in the 2011 census. Currently, over 10% of pupils in Wales is from a non-White British background. BAME pupils account for 32% of pupils in Cardiff schools, 24% in Newport Schools, 14 % in Swansea schools and 10% in Wrexham schools (PLASC, 2017[3]). Though BAME pupils are concentrated in Cardiff, Newport and Swansea, they live in each of Wales' 22 local authorities and are becoming more widely diffused geographically.

Table 1: % pupils over age 5 any other ethnic group than "White British" in each Local Authority in Wales (2017)

All Wales - 10.56%

Central South Wales- 16%		West/Mid Wales - 8.23%	
Cardiff	32%	Swansea	14%
Vale of Glamorgan	11.14%	Neath Port Talbot	5.70%
Bridgend	5.66%	Carmarthenshire	6.50%
RCT	4.28%	Pembrokeshire	5.65%
Merthyr	8.07%	Ceredigion	8.16%

Southeast Wales - 9.68%		North Wales - 6.55%	
Newport	23.74%	Wrexham	10.41%
Monmouthshire	4.97%	Flintshire	6.60%
Blaenau Gwent	4.52%	Denbighshire	5.74%
Torfaen	4.83%	Conwy	5.84%
Caerphilly	3.27%	Gwynedd	5.10%
		Anglesey	3.86%

Wales is a "super-diverse" society with many ethnic groups and no one particularly dominant minority ethnic group. There is much differentiation both within and between various ethnic groups in Wales. More than 130 languages are spoken in Wales' schools and BAME pupils in Wales represent 100+ ethnic groups. "White other" is the largest, including Gypsy/Traveller children and those from various European nations, followed by "Mixed Other," Bangladeshi and Pakistani[4]. The small sets of numbers within some ethnic groups in Wales, means that it is hard sometimes to compare by specific group, eg Indian rather than South Asian[5].

However, whereas pupils in Wales are becoming a more ethnically diverse group, teachers in Wales are not. Although more than 10% of pupils in Wales have ethnic minority heritage, BAME teachers account for less than 3% of teachers. From our desktop research and network queries, we didn't find evidence of any current BAME headteachers in Wales. In 2015/16, only 25 people of colour embarked upon Initial Teacher Training in Wales – 2% of the cohort[6]. This figure has been declining since 2010 and there is some evidence that aspiring BAME teachers avoid or leave the profession due to racism in schools[7].

In 2016, the charity Show Racism the Red Card conducted surveys with 125 trainee teachers and 435 teachers in Wales. One-third felt that they weren't equipped to recognise racism in the classroom and two-thirds did not feel confident supporting a victim through a racist incident[8]. Similarly, in England where 25% of primary school pupils are from BAME backgrounds, compared to 6.4% of teachers, in a 2012 post teacher-training survey nearly half felt they were neither prepared to teach to an ethnically diverse classroom, nor to deal with racist incidents in school[9].

Delegates at a March 2014 Conference, "Raising Aspirations: Ethnic Minority Achievement in Wales," expressed the view that coverage of diversity, equality and ethnic minority achievement in Initial Teacher Training was tokenistic and superficial with new teachers having only a "cosmetic" understanding of race, diversity and equality issues (Brentnall 2017:4)

What this shows, is that while Black and Minority Ethnic pupils constitute a significant and growing proportion of the Welsh population, there has been little evidence that their needs as defined by either the Wellbeing Act or the Donaldson review are currently being met. Rather, as evidence from research by Show Racism the Red Card Wales indicates, there is concern that educators do not feel prepared or confident to recognise racism, challenge it, and support victims.

Section Three: BAME Young people's experiences of Schooling in Wales

This section provides an overview of the way in which racism can manifest in schools and result in differential outcomes for BAME pupils. Understanding the diversity of manifestations is central to identifying the presence of racism in schools and thereby challenging it.

In December 2017, EYST Wales undertook a series of engagements with young school pupils on their experiences of racism, education, and diversity in the curriculum. The findings have been summarised below. This section aims to foreground the voices and experiences of young people, whose experiences should be central to any strategy to counter racism.

EYST Wales completed focus groups with secondary school with students aged 13-17. We conducted focussed discussions with self-selected members of established youth groups in Cardiff, Wrexham, Torfaen and Swansea. Youth workers who lead these groups explained the project in advance to group members and gave them the option of attending a focussed discussion relating to the topic of race/ethnicity in Welsh schools. In all cases except for the Wrexham focus group, the youth group leaders (with whom the young participants were familiar) co-facilitated the focussed discussions. A total of 31 students (19 girls and 12 boys) participated in the four focus groups. Each group consisted of a range of ethnicities, including Black African, Mixed White/Asian, Bangladeshi, Pakistani, Yemeni, Arab, Persian and Gypsy Traveller.

We began by asking pupils to identify personal aspirations and goals for school and compare the factors in school which they like and perceive to support them against the factors they want to change or which act as barriers to achieving goals. The discussion then moved to the topic of racism, first asking students to define their concept of racism and then asking about experiences of racism within school. The discussion closed by asking students thoughts on diversity in the curriculum and the topics they think they and their peers need to learn. The conversation in each focus group developed slightly differently according to the interests of participants with some emphasising racism as a point of discussion and some emphasizing diversity in the curriculum. The following is a summary of the various topics discussed in the groups:

Goals and Aspirations

We asked students to identify personal goals for the current school year, the next school year and the future. Every single student was able to identify something they wanted to achieve in school. There was a broad range but most related to the following categories: getting good grades or improving grades, working hard, choosing the right subjects, achieving qualifications such as GCSEs or A levels, achieving good grades on high stakes exams, going into further or higher education, becoming professionals/having good jobs, making friends and developing as a person. Many had very specific career goals such as paediatrician, engineer, medicine, Wales Rugby player, dentist, optician, midwife and teacher. Some expressed more interest in life skills such as running a household, doing MOT and taxes. A number expressed interest in running businesses or having skills to help with family business. One expressed that school should prepare you to "have the voice that you were made with" and help Travellers get equal rights. Most aim for higher education but some expressed more

9

interest in finding work or raising families. These responses are in line with other research which consistently shows that ethnic minority students in the UK have high aspirations and want to remain in school as long as they can.

Likes/Support Systems and Dislikes/Barriers Relating to School

Overall, students in the focus groups were satisfied with their schools, though some expressed middling and low evaluations. A post-discussion survey asking students to rate school satisfaction produced the following results:

How satisfied are you with your school?	Very satisfied	Pretty Good	OK	Not so great	Very Poor
	4	13	6	2	0

Within discussion, all students were able to identify positive aspects of their schools. Many participants referred to friends and their pupil peers as positives within the school environment. A handful referred to the quality of teachers. One girl in process of transferring from a Muslim primary school to a state-run school (and felt about bit nervous about the transition) said, "*I think that my previous school were really good at educating.*" Good qualities in teachers included the ability and will to motivate students and manage behaviour. *"Within our school, we are lucky to have teachers who will recognise not to focus on negative, to help you work towards [a goal], which will motivate you more."* This student went on to talk about how her teachers coached her through set-backs and noted that failing and trying again "*gives you an edge.*" Many participants referred to specific favourite subjects which they enjoy studying. Some students lauded the opportunity to build skills via extracurricular activities such as clubs and workshops on life skills such as financial literacy. One group spoke at length about the benefits of enterprise education in their schools and the opportunities it presents to build leadership, research and team skills. One group of students lauded the specialist workers who support them in school as well as a space that the school has provided where they can go any time of day to get help with homework or talk about problems - *"They get us."*

Likewise, all students were able to identify negative aspects of school life. Some students felt there was a lack of support for students due to large class sizes, which they think this is as unfair on the teachers as it is on the students. They clearly linked this with austerity. One Swansea student said, *"I know about budgets and about costs, but we have to suffer because of that."* A-level students noted the jump in independent learning from GCSEs. "*In GCSEs, you are spoon fed. In 6th form, you have to manage on your own and we are not taught how to do that.*" Some critiqued teachers and headteachers who "*aren't very good and are not helpful*" or have poor teaching methods or resort to shouting. One student mentioned supply teachers. A few students felt a lack of education about others and the need for more education on religion. "*There isn't enough ambassadors for each race.*" For the younger (Year 8) students especially, uniforms were a bother, most especially ties, and in the case of two girls, school PE kits. Lack of resources was also mentioned including lack of support for student mental health needs and family problems. One student wanted 1-1 support but couldn't access it. A few students criticized rules they viewed as harsh. Examples included threat of isolation for picking up a snowball or leaving a lunch tray on the table. *"It's not fair. We have the right to have fun"* (Girl, Wrexham).

Overall, students see school as important, exhibit sophisticated insight into school life and expressed optimism for their futures.

Experiences of Racism in Schools

Racism can be a sensitive topic and individuals have varying feelings about discussing it whether in a friendship group or with strangers. The groups varied in how openly they discussed racism, with some sharing numerous stories of personal experience whereas participants in other groups had less to say about the topic. To give the students more control over the discussion, we began by asking them to define their concepts of racism.

Understanding of Racism Students defined racism in terms of culture, religion, nationality and skin colour. "It's about being horrible to other people because of their religion, their colour, different background, different country – or like, just sometimes do it for fun" (Swansea boy). Many referred to not liking or pre-judging someone because of the colour of their skin or their ethnicity. "My definition is when someone is being cruel about your skin colour" (Cardiff girl). "Whenever someone's race, colour or religion is criticised in an unfair way" (Cardiff girl.) Most groups also referred to markers of ethnicity or religion, such as clothes, as being subject to racism. One person referred to being treated badly "because of where you were born" (Wrexham boy). Another group stressed equality of opportunity; racism is "not having the same opportunities as someone who is white" (Swansea girl). One boy from Swansea defined racism as an attitude toward difference, "For … the people who are racist, if the other person is different in any way, they will judge them for being different."

Prevalence of Racism Students in the focus groups recounted a variety of different experiences of racism and racist incidents in schools. In a post discussion survey, participants were asked if they had witnessed or experienced racism in schools. At least half of the discussion participants have witnessed and/or experienced a racist incident at school. (Even with the discussion groups that would not recount or speak of witnessing or experiencing racist incidents at schools – the post discussion survey, showed that people in those groups had.) A significant number (nearly a third of the total groups) said they weren't sure if they had witnessed or experienced a racist incident – cause for concern that children are questioning or lack confidence in their feelings and interpretations of experiences.

Have you witnessed racism or a racist incident at school?	Yes	No	I'm not sure	Don't want to say
	13	4	8	1

Have you experienced racism or racist incident at school?	Yes	No	I'm not sure	Don't want to say
	15	4	7	0

Everyday Racism For some students, racist incidents were normal. One group of Muslim Pakistani boys attending a predominantly White school presented a daily reality of embattlement. When asked if they experience racism in school, one replied, "*Almost every day.*" The racism takes many forms: people making racist comments as jokes, laughing at

them, calling them foreigners, making fun of their dress, their language. One said, *"Anything could be turned into a racist comment about you."* Another said, *"It makes you feel very alone"*. These boys had no faith that teachers or any adult in the school would address these incidents at all, let alone handle them with capacity and confidence. There was a specific place in their school to report such incidents but *"all they say about racism is keep your distance"*. *"In assembly, they say that they care, but if they tell you to keep your distance from racists, they don't [care]."* Another said, *"We want to roam free in school. We don't get justice and you're turning around and telling me to keep my distance when I ain't done nothing."*

In fact, the boys felt that reporting racist incidents may result in sanctions for them. *"We can't go past bullies, or we will be the ones in trouble."* These boys did refer to feeling treated differentially to white peers by teachers. They also described escalating arguments with other pupils which began with racist incidents and at times resulted in the person subject to the initial racism being sanctioned.   The boys described a very segregated school in which *"the Asians all stay together, White people stay together, and we [the groups] are all separated in school, so we [Asian students] all stay together."* They recounted that when teachers see them in a crowd *"they will always think something bad is going on."* *"Every time."* The person they feel they can confide in is their youth worker. These boys also experience regular racism when walking home from school both from fellow students and from adults. *"Its mostly people driving in cars and hanging out the window."* These incidents happen in a relatively affluent neighbourhood - *"It's a posh area, but there, it's the worst."*

Impact of Racism Students can be profoundly affected by a single racist incident. One young woman became emotional as she recounted an incident in Year 9 in which a fellow student pulled off her hijab. *"I can deal with people calling me names, but once it got physical"*. The incident was captured on CCTV; the school's response was swift, and the boy was disciplined with time in an isolation unit. The young woman still feels pain at the boy's punishment as she didn't want him placed in isolation but rather wanted him to understand that what was wrong with his action. *"The aftermath upset me more"*. To compound matters, their student peers supported the boy, expressing that the punishment was too harsh. The teachers were unaware of this dynamic amongst pupils and thus it went unaddressed. The school did not offer her a restorative approach, the option for dialogue with the offender. *"He never did say he was sorry to me. He never said anything to me after."* In discussing this incident, all five girls in the focus group expressed that restorative approaches to build relationships would be ideal in such scenarios. Some suggested that the school should have immediately organised a workshop to explain the significance of the hijab to address both the boy's transgression and the other students' lack of sympathy for the victim. *"I think perhaps afterwards they should have had someone talk to the class about what the hijab means to us and why we wear it. People think we are forced to wear it. They don't understand why we wear it."* Another explained that pulling off a girl's hijab is the same as pulling down someone's trousers. We paused in the discussion to address the feelings this incident dredged up in this young woman and her sister (also present). The youth worker and her peers reassured her that she is right to speak out against racist incidents and that she is not responsible for the perpetrator's punishment. She was reminded that the boy violated her human rights and that to grow as a person, he needed to be disciplined.

Islamophobic Racism Within discussions, a number of themes emerged regarding racist incidents and racist commentary: terrorism, racism as a "joke", and the importance of anti-racist education.   Several students referred to misconceptions and stereotypes about

12

terrorism as the basis for racist commentary. Two boys from Swansea said *"Because of what's going on with terrorism and they take the mick out of it,"* and, "They [call us] gangs [and say], 'Oh, they are going to bomb us.'"* One boy who moved to Swansea in 2015 and didn't speak much English at the time recounted the following story:

"Some would be horrible to me. They would say something in Arabic [like Allahu akbar] and 'You are going to blow the school up,' and they tried to check my bag to see if I have got something in it. I said, 'Leave me alone, I don't speak English,' and they kept being horrible and I went to [youth worker] and I don't know what to do. Now the person says that he is my friend and we go out together and sometimes I ask him why he did it and he says, 'We used to do it for fun,' and I said, 'You think it's fun to hurt other people's feelings. You can't laugh about it. Maybe it can cause damage to someone's brains.'"

Another student described how *"people use terrorism as a joke [and], if you are in an argument, they will bring it up, terrorist … [so they need to learn] the true meaning of that [word] and how it could be offensive."*

Racism as Banter All the groups mentioned that racist commentary frequently occurs "as a joke.[10]" Students had different thoughts about the implication of "joking" racist commentary, with some finding it troubling and others expressing no problem with it.   One Wrexham boy explained his classmates will say, "*You can run faster than us. You have more stamina than us,"* as he is of African descent." When prompted, he said, "*It doesn't bother me[11].*" The "N Word" was referenced as a common means of "racist joking." In a discussion at a girls' drop-in at Cardiff, one older girl said*, "I think it's not that deep because they understand each other and they know what they are saying."* Many participants expressed that teachers do not take the "N-word" or statements made with joking inflection seriously. The consensus is that teachers ignore these utterances. One young woman from Swansea finds this troubling and offensive. One person in her class told her, *"I can use the N word because [another black kid] said I could".* She responded*, "That's racist."* When she tells a teacher about these incidents, she is ignored. She says, *"Children swear all the time and obviously they are joking but they don't know how it makes you feel as a person."* Another person from the same group witnessed a black pupil being called the N word by peers: *"He pretends not to care and gets on with it."* It does beg the question if some students choose to ignore such utterances or 'go with the joke' as a defence mechanism.

Schools' response to Racism Most groups referred to a lack of education on the topic as contributing to the cause of racism and all students agree that anti-racism education is important. One Muslim girl said, *"Bad stories spread about us like wildfire."* They think that there should be more workshops throughout all stages of school, primary to secondary. Most of the students but not all had had sessions on anti-racism incorporated into PSE lessons, with quite a few able to recount Show Racism the Red Card workshops in PSE lessons.

Students were also asked about how racist incidents are handled in their schools. In post-discussion surveys 12/15 people who experienced racist incidents did report it to an adult at school. About 1/3 thought the response good, 1/3 neutral and 1/3 poor. The same split applies for students who witnessed racist incidents in evaluating the school response.

If you did experience and reported a racist incident, how good or bad was school response?	Very good	Good	Neutral	Bad	Very Bad	I don't know
	1	5	4	2	2	1

If you witnessed racism, how was the response of the school?	Excellent	Good	OK	Poor	Very Poor	Don't know	Don't want to say
	2	5	7	4	1	3	0

In discussions, those students who reported satisfaction with school response to racist incidents recounted incidents where they reported to the head of year, a clear point of contact to report.

Ten students (including seven who said they weren't sure if they had experienced a racist incident) chose not to report it to an adult at school. Following are reasons why students did not report racist incidents: *"Because no action is made." "Because they wouldn't understand."* One person who wasn't sure if he had been subject to a racist incident said he didn't report it because he *"didn't know how to say."* We asked the Swansea girls group if other students (witnesses) felt confident to report. They don't feel that other students would "have their backs" in their particular education institutions.

A few participants who experienced racist incidents recounted stories of making peace with the person who victimised them. The Swansea boy who was called a terrorist and had his rucksack searched became friends with the perpetrator after they started playing on the same rugby team. Another Swansea girl rebuilt a relationship with a schoolmate who pulled off her hijab (an incident in which the hijab pin got stuck in her chin). *"After a couple of years, I forgave them and they knew that."* Only one student referred to the school facilitating restorative practice. In Year 11, her friend was bullied on way home – with a schoolmate pulling down his trousers and "*saying horrible words like Pakis*." "*Normally my friends won't speak if anything happens; I'm the voice."* The head of house made them use restorative practice.

Not all experience Racism Some students had experienced little or no racism. One Swansea boy who hasn't experienced or witnessed a racist incident in school referred to his school as being ethnically diverse. He also attends a "Rights Respecting" school. Another boy from Swansea (who attends a different school) said that only once some older students harassed him but the people in his year group stood up for him. One girl from Cardiff explained she hasn't experienced racism because she attends a Muslim school where "*no one criticises anyone."*

Thoughts on Diversity in the Curriculum

Responses from post-discussion survey show that most students felt that their identities and history are not adequately represented in the curriculum. Most students felt than, when portrayed, their identities were portrayed in a positive or neutral way, but a significant number, 7/26 (26.9%), felt their identities were portrayed in a negative or very negative light.

Do you feel the curriculum reflects your identity/history?	Yes, very much	Yes, somewhat	Only just a little	Not at all
	2	9	6	7

When reflected, is it positive or negative?	Very positive	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Very Negative
	1	8	9	4	3

How important is it that the curriculum reflects you?	Very important	Important	Neutral	Not important	Totally unimportant
	10	8	5	2	0

Themes emerging from focus group discussions – a) appetite/need to learn current events and politics, b) Black history as dichotomy (civil rights heroes vs. spectre of slavery), c) desire for multi-ethnic role models across all subjects, e) superficial knowledge of teachers about global topics, especially regarding Islam; d) genuine diversity and multi-ethnic representation in curriculum as anti-dote to racist views.

Education about Global Events & Politics Participants in a Cardiff girls youth drop-in were adamant about the need for more education about current events and national and world politics.

- *"I want to know about history – the impact of history."*
- *"I want to learn about politics."*
- *"I want to learn why the UK left the EU."*
- *"I want to know about more about Theresa May because people say she's mean and say bad things about her."*
- *"It's always about kings and queens – that's not interesting."*

Some of the girls wanted to learn about what is happening in the Middle East. One asked her youth worker to explain what is happening in Syria and why it started. One person recounted that she had heard of the Palestine conflict but hadn't been taught it in school. She was frustrated that her RE teacher refused to engage in inquiries about Palestine. When she asked her RE teacher to explain the topic, the teacher responded, *"You can't ask me stuff like that."* The girl was perplexed as she viewed this as a fair RE topic. She explained, "I wasn't asking for her personal view – just the facts – and she didn't answer the facts."

Black history essentialising dichotomy: Civil rights heroes vs. the spectre of slavery When people did talk about learning black history, it was either learning about (American) civil rights heroes or about slavery. One girl from Swansea said, *"We learn about Martin Luther King and Malcolm X and I thought that was great."* One boy from Wrexham said, *"They do go into*

Black history in America." When I asked if they learn about Black history in the UK, all of them responded, *"Yes, about slavery."*[12] One girl from Cardiff summed up teaching on slavery as follows*: "Black people were slaves for White people."* When I asked the same group if they want to learn about slavery, one girl said, *"Yes, I want to know what they did to our people."*

Ethnically diverse role models across the curriculum – One girl from Cardiff said*, "I want us to be represented in our culture and religion; you need to know where we came from."* Swansea girls wanted to have more examples of BAME role models in Science subjects. They couldn't think of any when asked. When presented by their youth worker that a Muslim woman established the first university, one Swansea girl said, "*We need to hear more wild cards."* The researcher queried, "Why do you say 'Wild card?' to which she replied, "*Because you never hear about them and so you're shocked when you hear about them."* The girls also expressed the important of embedding and representing ethnic diversity throughout the curriculum: *"In every subject, we want to hear a fact about Muslim people achieving big stuff – not just Muslims but different races – so instead of [being allotted to history or RE], in Maths in the odd lesson, we learn about past people past who discovered different things."* At least one student referred to "whitewashing" history (without using that word): *"It's all the majority white. It's like White people took it in and made it their culture. You don't hear where it comes from*." Girls from Swansea articulated the importance of such a curriculum for all students moving into a global society: *"After you finish school, you are in the big wide world; you will meet so many people and you shouldn't be shocked."* The group of girls in Torfaen were appreciative that they have a centre in their school where they learn about their own Gypsy Traveller culture along with human rights.

Education on Religions Cardiff girls expressed interest in learning about a variety of different religions: Buddhism, Hinduism, Sikhism and noted that what you learn depends on what school you go to in what year – luck of the draw. When asked how Islam is taught, one said, *"They don't go into detail they just mostly compare Islam and Christianity – the similarities and differences."*   One girl said she understood this as the UK "*is not an Islamic country,*" which prompted a discussion about whether the UK is a "Christian" country and whether students should learn about Islam because there are 1.3 billion Muslims in the world. One girl in Swansea said, "[*In school RE], I learned about Islam but not in the right way. It was ridiculous. It was all cultural and not a true reflection of what Islam is*."

Young people recognised the potential for diversity in curriculum and anti-racist education. The Cardiff girls group stressed that students must learn about *"terror and where it comes from, because its always shown as a Muslim."* One Swansea female student stressed that *"with the stigma about Muslims, I want the teachers to learn more"*.

In the context of discussion on diversity in the curriculum, students were also asked if they had had BAME teachers in the classroom. A couple of boys from Swansea mentioned a South Asian teacher who they said everyone laughed at particularly due to her pronunciation of English words. There was also someone training to be a teacher from Sussex – there for a month and left. And a Bengali teacher "*who never irons his clothes*". A few Cardiff girls mentioned they had one BAME teacher "*but no one listens to him.*" These girls also noted that a lot of the student and supply teachers and assistant teachers are BAME. *"We have had Somali, Sudani, Canadian, but they are usually always supply teachers"* One girl who goes to an ethnically diverse school noted that most of the "main teachers" are white, whilst most of

the students are Pakistani or other ethnic minority groups. The school has a number of non-white teaching assistants who are mostly there to support EAL students.

Section Summary

This section sought to present, based on both academic research and personal testimonies, the ways in which young people encounter racism in schools. It highlighted both overt forms of racism, such as hate crime and bullying, but also more covert ways, such as bias in disciplining BAME students (particularly males) and institutional discrimination. It concluded with a consideration of diversity in curriculum, both for the transformative effect it can have on tackling racism, but also the way in which a white-centred Eurocentric syllabus can disadvantage and further push BAME experiences from the mainstream.

Section Four: Managing Race in Schools in Wales: The Policy Context

This section provides an overview of the way in which racism can manifest in schools and result in differential outcomes for BAME pupils. Understanding the diversity of manifestations is central to identifying the presence of racism in schools and thereby challenging it.

Racist Incidents in Schools

Racist incidents are common in schools in Wales. Pupils often express racist views when in school and teachers and staff are ill-prepared to confront these incidents effectively and confidently. In 2003, EALAW surveyed 150 pupils, 70% of whom reported experiencing racism (35% not often or only once, 9% frequently). The study found that "racism affects pupils' self-esteem, sense of identity and confidence in the education system [and] schools' inability to address racism effectively leaves pupils feeling isolated, hurt and angry which can lead to disaffection." That was 16 years ago; people are saying same thing about schools inability to tackle racism." Numerous teacher surveys indicate that teachers feel unprepared to confront racist incidents in an effective way. Recognising and responding to racism is an afterthought in most teacher training.

In 2016, Show Racism the Red Cardiff (SRtRC) published a ground-breaking research report titled "Racism and anti-racism in the Welsh education system". SRtRC worked with 1157 learners, teachers and trainee teachers through focus groups, consultation voting, questionnaires and electronic surveys across Wales. Nearly all learners felt that racial discrimination happens in their school. Four out of ten Welsh BAME students have suffered from racial discrimination and a fifth of children admitted to using racist language against a peer in school setting.

Institutional Racism

Racist incidents and bullying can be easy to spot and therefore easier to talk about when compared to institutional racism. But most racism is insidious, everyday racism happening in institutions, endemic, mundane and normal – business as usual. Eighteen years after the Race Relations Act 2000 amendment forcing schools to promote racial equality and 8 years after the Equality Act of 2010, racism is more present than ever. Institutional racism is born out in inequality disproportionately historically affecting BAME groups and especially BAME young people across Wales. Considering how institutional racism affects ethnic minority students is just as important, if not more, as considering incidences of racist behaviour in the Welsh education system. The Macpherson report defined institutional racism as "the collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service to people because of their, colour, culture or ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour which amount to discrimination, through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racial stereotyping which disadvantage minority ethnic people (Macpherson 1999:28). It is outcome and effect rather than intent that makes something racist. High stakes testing, selective grouping via ability and school performance tables are being used increasingly even though, their adverse impact on Black students is well known[13]. The following are just a few topics which educators and policy makers in Wales must address:

Exclusions and behaviour management

In Wales Black and Mixed ethnicity students are excluded at higher rates for all forms of school exclusions, a pattern observable for many years with numerous explanations: teachers' stereotyping and low expectations, student teacher conflict, pupils challenging authority[14]. Gypsy, Traveller and Roma students also face higher rates of exclusions. Jonathan Brentnall's research demonstrated through existing and new empirical research how Black African and Caribbean student face more extreme consequences for behaviour in the classroom when compared to white counterparts (including sometimes for behaviour that is in reaction to perceived racist incidents or institutional racism)[15]. There is evidence that students who actively "perform ethnicity," e.g. take pride in markers of ethnic difference such as African hairstyles, are perceived and treated as "bad students" by teachers[16]. Black Caribbean, Mixed White and Black Caribbean backgrounds are overrepresented in BESD diagnoses even when socio-economic differences are controlled for, suggesting that school processes may be involved including racist attitudes and differential treatment by teachers[17]. The United Nations has recommended that all UK nations review the disproportionate rate of school exclusion of pupils from Gypsy, Traveller, Roma or African Caribbean communities in order ensure they fulfil obligations as a signatory to the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (UNCERD). Potential solutions to reducing this adverse and inequitable rate of exclusions include: restorative justice, teachers trained to have consistent approach to behaviour management, teachers with cultural competence. Brentnall identified the following suggestions to address the issue of exclusions: Schools can promote the use of restorative justice and Welsh Government can investigate why larger portions of black and mixed ethnicity and GRT pupils are excluded examining data to see if there is bias against any ethnic group in illegal exclusions, pupil isolation and internal school discipline.

Setting and Banding

Research consistently finds that white teachers disproportionately place Black students in low ranked groups and there is anecdotal evidence that some schools have a limited number of ethnic minority students placed in higher tier exams[18]. Brentnall argues we need more evidence and data to understand the extent to which this is happening in Wales[19]. The following suggestions arose from a workshop at which educators discussed engaging and improving academic achievement for Black and Mixed Ethnicity in Wales[20]. Schools can establish an ethos of inclusion and communicate high expectations to ethnic minority pupils. Schools can also examine how students of different ethnic groups are faring and if any are disadvantage by school practices. Local authorities can improve educators understanding of unconscious bias and how persistent negative stereotypes can affect their judgement. Local authorities can also improve educators understanding of the tendency for teachers to overreact to disruptive behaviour of Black and Mixed pupils to understand the root causes of their disruptive behaviour. Welsh Government can assess national tests for cultural bias and evaluate implementation procedures for national tests to identify any process which disadvantage certain ethnicities. Welsh Government can also stress that schools must use a holistic, developmental assessment profiles and a broad range of information to inform setting/banding of students.

Mental Health services in schools

Currently mental health services in schools do not meet the needs of BAME students and BAME students take them up in low numbers[21]. Providing pastoral care to BAME pupils can require high level of expertise to deal issues of culture, language, faith, racism effectively. There are not sufficient numbers of teachers or counsellors with ethnic minority backgrounds to offer appropriate pastoral care with adequate cultural understanding or (when required) in pupils first language.

In order to tackle deep rooted, endemic and mundane everyday racism, we need for both teachers and students to develop a racial literacy – to educate teachers and pupils to understand our multi-ethnic society "based on facts and informed discussions in classrooms rather than headlines" and for teachers to be prepared to "construct counter-narratives" to racist statements or incidents and to develop curricula which reflect experiences of the student population[22].

Educational Attainment

Multiple, potentially intersecting, factors may contribute to various attainment levels among groups of pupils, but there are high and low achieving pupils in all ethnic groups and pupil attainment often varies between local authorities[23]. The following factors are often referenced in explanations of educational attainment: school effectiveness, socio-economic disadvantage, special educational needs (SEN), English language proficiency, gender, discrimination and culture.

In Wales, gaps within ethnic minority achievement have generally been closing with a few exceptions. For the years 2014-2016, Indian and Chinese pupils performed higher than the national average at all key stages[24]. In the last 10 years, Bangladeshi and Pakistani students have caught up with or surpassed the national average at Key Stage 4. However, attainment figures for several Black and Mixed ethnicities are below the national average with some showing a decline in achievement through key stages 1-4[25]. Within Wales Black Caribbean students have been showing some same pattern for a long time. In a 2003 study, EALAW found Black Caribbean pupils attained higher than the national average at Key Stage 1 and then decline to 28% below the national average for 5+ A*-C grades at Key Stage 4. Gypsy Traveller and Roma pupils have the lowest attainment with 24.2 percent of pupils in 2014-16 achieving Level 2 inclusive[26] at Key Stage 4, compared to White British at 58.8%[27]. White other pupils attained 51.9 %, also lower than the national average.

Much attention is focussed on the link between socio-economic status (SES) and student attainment, but that link may not be as strong for non-White ethnic groups. In Wales over all, students eligible for Free School Meals (eFSM) lag behind non-FSM students in educational attainment at GCSE level. In Wales, Pupils from Gypsy, Roma, Irish Traveller, Black African, Black Caribbean, and Black African and Mixed backgrounds have high levels of FSM eligibility, whereas pupils from Chinese, Indian and Other White backgrounds are much less likely to be eligible for FSM. Some studies show that the link between SES and student attainment varies across ethnicities. In one study, White British eFSM pupils achieved far less than their non-White eFSM counterparts[28]. Another study showed that living in a deprived neighbourhood has less impact on Black & Asian students compared to White students[29]. A 2003 study by

EALAW found that SES factors don't completely account for difference in attainment between White British and BAME pupils in Wales[30]. Likewise, there is a strong link between high SES and high student attainment in White pupils, whereas that link is not as pronounced with Black African Students[31]. High SES is not translating into increased education attainment for Black students in the same way that it is for White students. The Wales School Census 2017 gives figures for overall FSM and non-FSM achievement but does not analyse how that may vary across ethnic groups.

In a response to an inquiry on Education Improvement Grant (EIG), the Welsh Government agrees that it should do more to improve educational outcomes amongst Black/Black British and mixed ethnicity White and Black Caribbean learners and as well as Gypsy, Roma and Traveller learners. It also agrees that this should include a specific focus on each as a particular group of learners and not rely solely on more general initiatives to raise attainment across the board[32]. In 2014, the Welsh Government organised a two-hour workshop session bringing educators together to discuss educational engagement and attainment of Black and Mixed ethnicity pupils. Attendees surmised that targeted interventions need to be long term and sustained and must involve parents, pupils and community members[33]. Likewise, schools should present role models from a wide range of professions and sectors in order to help young pupils from ethnic minority backgrounds to "develop a racial and cultural literacy to strengthen their self-image." (Brentnall 2017:22). Previous studies have referred to cultural bias and discrimination when explaining the underachievement of Black boys, including low expectations from teachers, racism and lack of representation in the curriculum.[34] Lewis and Starkey found that teachers' negative perceptions and institutional racism and have a negative impact on student attainment.[35]

For years, Welsh Government provided targeted funds to support the achievement of BAME and GRT pupils, but in recent developments, likely will not be providing such specific funding in the future. Even as the number of ethnic minority pupils is increasing in Wales, since 2013, the amount of funds dedicated to their support has been decreasing with funding "moved into broader initiatives for all learners."[36] In 2015, the Welsh Government chose to remove the ring fenced per-pupil Minority Ethnic Achievement Grant (£10.5 million at 2014-15) and Gypsy and Traveller Grant (1.1 million at 2014-15) which along with 11 other educational grants were collated into the generic Education Achievement Grant (EIG) which is held by Regional Consortia and provided primarily to mainstream schools rather than specialist centralised services (the old Traveller Education Services for example). As these specialist services were cut there was the reduction in White/British/Majority staff was 16.2% and the reduction in BAME/GT staff was 21.8%[37]. Brentnall argues that disproportionate cuts to frontline support for BAME/GT pupils combined with disproportionate impact on BAME staffing may be in breach of Equality Legislation.

In 2016, following stakeholder concerns, the Children, Young People and Education Committee held an inquiry into the Education Inclusion Grant (EIG) and the education of Gypsy, Roma and Traveller and Minority Ethnic Pupils. Amongst its findings were that the arrangements for tracking and monitoring the use of the EIG for the specific benefit of ethnic minority and Gypsy, Roma and Traveller pupils were weak, and a number of

recommendations were made. The Welsh Government responded accepting a number of these outcomes to and are in the process of implementing these in the current period, including fortifying monitoring for the benefit of ethnic minority and gypsy traveller pupils. (http://senedd.assembly.wales/mgIssueHistoryHome.aspx?IId=16200) The enquiry also recommended the Welsh Government undertake a thorough, updated impact with specific regard to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Welsh Government's statutory responsibilities regarding children's rights and equalities. The Welsh Government rejected this recommendation, stating its previous equality impact assessments were sufficient.

Since this time, the Cabinet Secretary for Education announced that funding for BAME and GRT pupils will be entirely transferred to the RSG. Following representations from the sector, some interim funding has been allocated for the specific support of BAME and GRT pupils. However, medium- and long-term funding remains cloudy, with a number of stakeholders expecting that the services will disappear in the long term.

Numerous studies show that BAME pupils are aspirational and their parents have high expectations of them[38]. The picture overall is that many BAME pupil groupings are doing well in school, but there is evidence these achievements convert into occupational/professional success at a lower rate than their White counterparts. Young people from BAME and other White backgrounds are more likely than White counterparts to participate in Higher Education but are less likely to be working in graduate level jobs after achieving a degree. UK wide, educational attainment of BAME groups is up over last 10 years; however, BAME students are underrepresented both at Russell Group Universities and in Apprenticeships[39]. The rate of acceptance into super-elite institutions such as Oxbridge is even more dismal. The past 50 years in the UK shows an improving education structure and improving gender equality, but consistent research shows that ethnic minorities face ethnic penalties in the labour market -meaning that when geography, family size, education level, etc are taken into account – ethnic minority people with similar achievement, experience and circumstance fair less well than their White counterparts[40]. Ethnic minority people are also at higher risk for cyclical unemployment and are more vulnerable to effects of recessions. These dynamics should weigh heavy – as we ask ourselves if the growing number of ethnic minority pupils with increasing achievements will thrive in our society. For instance, if ethnic minority pupils represent over 30% of Cardiff's cohort, are we creating a society, where those children will be taking up professional and managerial positions in due numbers when they leave education and enter the world of work?

Diversity in the Curriculum

The curriculum in Wales and other UK countries is a White curriculum, a system of knowledge shaped by colonialism and imperialism, which with very few exceptions celebrates the achievements of white people. Wales is currently re-writing the national curriculum and as such as such, can take that opportunity to truly create a curriculum which shows the contribution of many ethnicities to British society, is critical of practices in the British Empire, reflects a global history and showcases achievements of people of various ethnicities in different parts of the world in all topics. The Donaldson Review articulates goals of Welsh education as follows: a) ambitious, capable learners, ready to learn throughout their lives; b)

enterprising creative contributors, ready to play a full part in life and work; c) ethical informed citizens of Wales and the world; and d) healthy, confident individuals ready to live fulfilling lives as valued members of society. Developing authentic diversity (not tokenistic or cosmetic) in the curriculum will serve each of those purposes. The curriculum content is currently being developed and will soon be tested in pioneer schools. However, to ensure that authentic diversity is included in the curriculum, it is important to seek multiple BAME, GRT and ethnic minority perspectives and make a conscious decision to get it right this time.

The United Nations has recommended that all UK nations review the way that the British Empire and slavery are taught – to be a more balanced representation – in order ensure they fulfil obligations as a signatory to the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (UNCERD).

In 2014, the Welsh Government organised a workshop for educators to discuss how to improve the school experience and educational outcomes and for Black and Mixed ethnicity students. One topic discussed was diversity in the curriculum. They reached three conclusions:

1) Need more diverse content including Black history, minority ethic history and world studies. There is very little positive context about Black people. The units which refer to Black people are too narrowly focussed on slavery, colonialism and civil rights and topics with Black people represented are restricted to Black History Month rather than being integrated into the whole curriculum and presented steadily throughout the year.

2) Integration of diversity in content and resources across the curriculum varies between schools. The extent to which diversity in the curriculum is addressed depends on location, community make-up, the school and pupil make-up. Some schools treat diversity in the curriculum tokenistically and cosmetically and, in some schools, ethnic minority pupils rarely see their racial, ethnic or cultural or national identifies portrayed.

3) A diverse curriculum needs to be part of a genuine inclusive whole school ethos which positively recognises Black and Mixed identities, boosts pupil engagement and achievement and involves good relationships/positive tone between pupils and staff. Teachers need development and training on teaching a diverse curriculum.[41]

The workshop attendees also identified actions for schools, local authorities and Welsh Government. Schools can identify how to incorporate positive context about achievements of ethnic people in all curriculum areas and encourage BAME pupils to contribute input about themselves and their cultural knowledge. Schools can also provide balanced and accurate information about current events. Local authorities can evaluate the way schools engage with current affairs (particularly those that may result in misunderstanding) and provide regular guidance on equality/diversity matters. Welsh Government can scrutinise the new curriculum to measure how much of that content includes ethnic minority people and how much show positive content about achievements and contributions to the world development[42].

Section Five: Expert Spotlights

In this section we bring together the voices and views of three experts in the field to share their perspectives. Sunil Patel of Show Racism the Red Card, Trudy Aspinwall of Travelling Ahead, and Uzi Iwobi of Race Council Cymru. Their insights and views provide a strong addition to the academic overview provided in the sections prior.

Expert Spotlight: Show Racism the Red Card & Anti-Racism in Schools
Sunil Patel, Wales Campaign Manager

Background

Show Racism the Red Card is an anti-racism charity, which was established in Newcastle in January 1996 and the Wales office was established in 2006. The charity delivers anti-racism workshops to young people and adults through its schools programme with the aim of harnessing the potential of professional footballers as anti-racist role models and combatting racism through anti-racism education.

Our works in schools

We are at the forefront of delivering anti-racism across the UK with over 50,000 young people attending our workshops in the schools. In Wales, we work with approximately 13,500 young people per academic year. Our main delivery is in Primary and Secondary schools.

Racism in schools

Over the past few years, we have raised our concerns of what in our view, has been an increase in prejudice views expressed by young people and in particular, towards Immigration and Anti-Muslim/Islamophobia. This coupled by the lack of confidence and training support to teachers and other education practitioners has elevated issues of racism and racist bullying in schools across Wales.

Our Report published in September 2016

Due to the concerns raised above and the lack of information available on this issue, the charity in Wales conducted a consultation that included pupils and teachers from across Wales. Our findings confirmed that racism continues to be an issue in the education system in Wales. We strongly urge that our report should be used as a catalyst for change. Some of the facts from the report included:-

1 in 4 teachers was surveyed (435) stated they had responded to or had a pupil report racial discrimination during a 12 month period.

- 65% of teachers were not confident in supporting the victims.
- 69% not confident in filling in racist incident report forms for Local Authorities.
- 70% do not feel well trained or confident when following up racist incidents with senior staff or parents.

Comments

- "People just don't like black people or anyone who isn't white…Muslims and that, any one different." – Year 6 Pupil.
- "In PE when people make a bad tackle someone will say n*****r to them." – Year 5 Pupil.
- "Here everyone thinks if they see a black person they are a terrorist… they link black people with Muslims." - Year 6 Pupil.

Our work since the report – Post-Brexit

In our view, the result of the EU referendum has exacerbated the problem and we have seen the effects of this in the schools. Teachers have expressed their concerns as this email from a school in Wales highlights:

> "Good afternoon. Lately in our schools, we have had a number of incidents. Couple this with the feelings of the community on Brexit, etc and the overwhelming support for Trump and we are concerned that we need to be doing more. We have specific days and PSE resources to tackle racism, but I am wondering if you can help us raise more awareness with a specialist assembly, bespoke day, etc."

There is little doubt that the EU referendum result has triggered the rise in hate crime with 85% relating to race and religion.

'The consequence of the Brexit vote is that both the campaign and the result has caused unnecessary social divisions and, in some cases, provided a 'street legitimacy' for racist sentiment'   Carolyn Harris, MP for Swansea East

Twin schools project

In the summer of 2017, we linked up with 2 Secondary schools in Wales with pupils conducting research on racism and young people sharing their experiences outside of school.   These were some of the comments from pupils:

- It wasn't me it was my mum, because she wore a hijab people use to shout stuff at her while driving like ninja (boy, age 16) ⬚ They told me to go back to my own country, but Wales is my country (girl, aged 14
- I was standing outside a mosque with my mosque clothes and this man approached me and said look at this **** Muslim, looks like ISIS (boy, aged 16)
- We moved to a house and we were the only Muslims there and they broke my brother's car and set fire in our garden (girl, aged 12)

- I was in the park and I was sat down on a bench. 2 people come up to me and said get off! This is our bench, not for dark coloured skin Muslims like you (girl, age 13)
- A girl at a football tournament told me to go back to 'Packy land' and made fun of me for being Muslim (girl, aged 12)

<u>Increase in requests for support from schools in Wales</u>

For the period September 2016 to August 2017, SRtRC has been contacted by teachers from 16 of the 22 local authorities across Wales. Some of these teachers were seeking support for workshop provisions whilst others were responding directly to a racist incident at their school. There have been twice as many schools contacting the charity in the first 8 weeks of the 2017/18 Academic year compared to the same period last Academic year.

The statistics:

- Racist incidents were recorded in 13/22 local authorities.
- 38% of teachers who contacted the charity specified that they were doing so in response to a racist incident in their school.
- Only 50% of these enquiries who reported racial incident resulted in a SRtRC workshop, funding was the sole reason the other 50% could not be supported.

Comments from teachers:

- Difficulties with Muslim students being stereotyped as terrorists.
- Year 5 pupils making racist observations 'shut up you Asian immigrant'.
- Incident outside school involving primary school pupil being racist to an adult.
- Year 3 child racist comments to children of Afro Caribbean background 'dirty skin'.
- Yr 5 pupil white pupil called a black pupil chocolate cookie

<u>Conclusion</u>

There is a great opportunity to embed anti-racism within the curriculum following the Donaldson review. In our research from last year, 90% of teachers stated that anti-racism should be imbedded in the curriculum. There has to be a commitment from everyone in the Education sector to deal with racist bullying. There needs to be better representation of BAME communities in the public sector including teaching if real change is to be made.

Contact: Sunil Patel sunil@theredcardwales.org

Website www.theredcard.org/wales

Trudy Aspinwall, Team Manager, Tros Gynnal Plant

The Travelling Ahead project was set up in 2010 by Save the Children to work with Gypsy, Roma and Traveller[43] (GRT) children and young people; the project has been part of TGP Cymru since 2017 and now offers a Wales-wide advocacy service to GRT communities of all ages across Wales supporting them to access their rights and entitlements.

The Committee on the Rights of the Child has consistently commented on the right to education for Gypsy, Roma and Traveller children in the UK and in 2016 noted *'Substantial inequalities persist in educational attainment particularly for Roma, Gypsy and Traveller children'* and that *'Among children subject to permanent or temporary school exclusions, there is a disproportionate number of boys, Roma, Gypsy and Traveller children…'* (CRC Concluding Observations UK 2016)

Welsh figures show that Gypsy and Traveller pupils remain the lowest achieving group[44] according to Welsh Government benchmarks and that they have the highest rates of absenteeism from primary and secondary schools (this includes authorised absences[45]).

High levels of absence and low levels of attainment are of course linked and it's been recognised in Welsh Government guidance that poor levels of attendance correspond to a 'distinct set of barriers that Gypsy and Traveller pupils encounter while at school' (Moving Forward 2008). The guidance goes on to say:

Gypsy and Traveller groups have specific cultural and life-style characteristics which may not be generally understood, and which can contribute to the prejudice that they many experience from the non-Traveller population. Their long-held culture is not static, however, and a feature of Gypsy and Traveller communities is their ability to adapt to changing economic and social circumstances whilst retaining their cultural identity. Recognition, understanding, and acceptance of these cultural differences are key to effective educational support for Gypsy and Traveller pupils. (Pages 9-10 Moving Forward)

Young people's views
Education is a consistent theme brought up by the young people that the Travelling Ahead project has worked with since 2010; in our peer education research report young people identified from their experiences several issues that they feel affect their education:

- A lack of understanding and low levels of awareness of schools and teaching staff about their culture and experiences;
- Discrimination and bullying that can result from such lack of understanding;
- Lack of a culturally relevant or flexible curriculum;
- Their own and parental anxieties about their safety and exposure to teachings and practices that conflict with their cultural values (e.g. drug taking and sexual activity topics in PSE);
- Tensions that can exist between 'formal education' and a sense that mainstream school doesn't either respect or prepare them for life with their families and communities.

The improvements they recommended included:
- Teachers in school need to try and understand our culture and how we work with our families;
- They should have training on understanding Gypsies, Roma and Travellers to help us achieve our best;
- Find a way to build relationships between our families and schools to break down barriers and increase our participation in education;
- If we are being bullied or experiencing a hate crime, there must be a teacher or adult who we can talk to and who can help us report things if we need to;
- Make sure we have access to up-to-date equipment and access to computers and the internet if we don't have it at home, or are travelling, to help with our homework.
- Access to more hands-on courses, like Building and Hair and Beauty, and not just academic courses;
- Extra funding put in place to support us in school and for trained tutors to help us learn if we want home tutoring.[46]

Key issues – some of which may be shared with other ethnic minority groups

- Funding – grant changes mean that there is now no bespoke funding for GRT pupils which also leads to less scrutiny of how money is being allocated to these pupils and whether it is benefitting the individuals and groups that the previous grant supported. Equality and children's rights impact assessments have not been robustly carried out on the effect of these changes by Welsh Government and by most local authorities.
- Lack of knowledge, flexible, bespoke approaches of many schools to meet individual needs and build up trust with families. Good practice is not consistent across local authority areas and guidance is not up to date.
- Wales' curriculum is not relevant or flexible enough to meet and engage many GRT pupil needs. There is a lack of inclusion or reflection of Gypsy, Roma and Traveller history, lives or culture despite. This is despite the existence and availability of a 'Travelling Together' curriculum resource, which is in danger of sitting on virtual shelf, because its usage is not monitored and its content is not kept up to date: (http://learning.gov.wales/docs/learningwales/publications/140304-travelling-together-guidance-en.pdf). Moreover, it remains unclear if and how GRT views and experiences have been taken into account in Donaldson's curriculum review.

- Research is urgently needed on levels of exclusion for Gypsy and Traveller children. England research by The Traveller Movement shows it is very high http://travellermovement.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/Never-Giving-Up-On-Them.pdf, but figures are not available on a Wales-wide level.
- Lack of recognition of racism and hate crime/incidents directed to Gypsy, Roma and Traveller pupils by teachers, compounded by teachers' lack of confidence /skills in tackling racist bullying. Show Racism the Red Card has created a resource on tackling these issues for teachers in Wales, but it is underused as there is a lack of budget to train teachers how to implement it. https://static1.squarespace.com/static/574451fe37013bd0515647ac/t/59102277ff7c50 2e7838363e/1502876574094/GRT+Toolkit+- +Promoting+Equality+and+Tackling+Racism.pdf
- Lack of recording/monitoring of racist bullying and hate crime in schools for GRT pupils (Despite Tackling Hate Crime Framework and Respecting Other Guidance) and failure to collate figures county-wide or Wales-wide to measure bullying levels – a basic indicator of whether children rights are being met for certain groups.
- Significant number of children from the Gypsy, Roma and Traveller community are not in school **at all** now but are Electively Home Educated (EHE) – due to parents not trusting schools to be safe and relevant. This means the children don't attract any funding to work with them, are not accessing their right to education and usually don't benefit from other resources, support and programmes that are accessed through formal education e.g. counselling, school nurse, TAF, Duke of Edinburgh, work experience and vocational training at Key Stage 4 for example. There is no legal obligation to either monitor or support parents with elective home education.

Contact: Trudy Aspinwall Trudy.Aspinwall@tgpcymru.org.uk

Website: http://www.travellingahead.org.uk/

Mrs. Uzo Iwobi, Chief Executive Officer, Race Council Cymru

Introduction

When thinking about black history in Wales it is easy for the wrongs of the past to obscure the reality of our present and future. The ways in which black history and racism are linked and reproduced is challenging and ever changing with a growing need to dissociate images of slavery, segregation, or riots when representing black history, and instead educate on the positives of diversity in Wales. Can we alter the ways in which we perceive the many positive impacts black history has in Welsh history and would this alteration in change of perspective contribute to inclusion, equality and anti-discrimination lacking within our communities?

With the growth in far-right activism and social movements over recent years, we need to identify the barriers to race equality and healthy race relations with a focus on individuals influenced by and reproducing skewed and outdated interpretations of difference. Despite how far we have come from days when black people were treated as second class citizens, everyday racism still saturates Welsh society[47]. Racism has in many ways become an offensive subject in almost every setting, with reactions either met with hostility, denial or change of subject. Racism makes us all uncomfortable; black and white people alike. However, the reality is that Britain as a nation has rarely been tolerant and fair toward people of difference has only ever been so in significant in eras of socio-economic stability in brief spells over the past hundred years. Even during these periods of calm, racism only ever settled, awaiting the next incident to stir up hatred inherent amongst the masses.

Many believe the government/media are to blame for the ways in which we perceive immigration with racism, discrimination, islamophobia, and xenophobia a result of certain policies and campaigns. Turnout was high at 71.7% for Wales in the leave campaign[48] and with the rise in racism in Wales post Brexit there is ample testimony of insecurity and intolerance towards foreigners. Statistics indicate the lack of education and understanding needed within Welsh education to accommodate our diverse and multiracial country. The present and future Wales may need to work even harder to strengthen the rich history and heritage of our diverse nation, of which Black History plays a part.

Between 1948 and 1970 nearly half a million-people left their British colony homes in the West Indies (or Caribbean Basin) to start new lives in Britain in response to encouraging propaganda at a time of labour shortage in the Motherland. West Indians came to Britain for many different reasons; some sought economic opportunities, to fill the shortage of labour and return home, while others were returning soldiers who had fought for Britain during the Second World War (1939-1945). On arrival in the UK, many migrants were faced with a reality far from the expectations they had built of their new lives. Instead of feeling welcome, many were faced with hostility that led to increased racial tensions and riots in times of high

unemployment. African Caribbean migrants were walking on eggshells from the moment they arrived and although we can say that we have come a long way in equality for all over the past 50 years, we still have a long way to go before we can truly celebrate a society free from race discrimination. In Wales, Cardiff is home to one of the oldest multi-ethnic communities in Britain with Cardiff Bay (previously known as Tiger Bay) providing a home to people from over 50 different countries. Differences in black groups in their migration histories and consequent social and economic positions has led to variances in the experiences of some inequalities they still experience today.

By embedding Black History in school's curriculum, through education of school children, some of these inequalities might start to be recognised, understood and challenged; as well as provide the opportunity for black history to be celebrated by all people living in Wales.

Challenges

It is important to recognise the challenges faced by children and young people living in Wales today especially those targeted because of their skin colour, doing all possible to ameliorate the rigors faced by ethnic minority children who are made to live and thrive in a hostile environment – in school or work. For individuals everywhere, the battle of acceptance for who you are is ongoing. Only when we understand and experience the struggles faced by children and young people in an ever-changing world, we can begin to understand how it must feel to be attacked verbally or physically for being born with a darker skin tone. We are often outraged by the brutality we hear of in the world today, and yet we seem less sensitised by the discrimination we see or hear in our schools, perhaps even by our children. We must work together to embed and teach Black History as part of Welsh shared history in schools across Wales.

If unchecked, the next generation of children will portray the prejudicial attitudes of their forefathers who are often blind to the benefits of multiculturalism in our schools.

There are many children and young people of mixed heritage who speak Welsh fluently and who live in Welsh communities but due to physical difference feel they do not belong in Wales and are not accepted by their peers as a result of racial abuse. Often, they know more about Wales and Welsh history than their African or Caribbean heritage and the linage with black Welsh history may never be celebrated. In applying Black history to our curriculum, children and young people everywhere may take pride in the history of their forefathers and may be given an opportunity to investigate their linage in a positive, inclusive, and open environment. Benefits of including Black History studies in the school curriculum would be immeasurable and will positively apply to children and young people from diverse backgrounds.

Welsh Education

One of the most powerful ways we can support future generations in Wales is acknowledging the importance of a whole-school approach in creating an inclusive culture and furthermore contributing to the prevention of prejudice and discrimination on the grounds of difference; whether this be racial, religious or cultural difference. There are invaluable opportunities for positive cohesion messages to be promoted through learning experiences, reaching people across all age groups and backgrounds. Learning has the potential to be a very powerful tool

in promoting integration and mutual respect. Participating in learning can take place at different times in our lives and there are a host of settings in which it can be accessed. There are invaluable opportunities for positive cohesion messages to be promoted through learning experiences, reaching people across all age groups and backgrounds[49].

In using curriculum opportunities too spread an understanding of multiculturalism and diversity through history, pupils will have a heightened sense of belonging and equal status amongst their peers. In celebration of Black History in Wales, pupils may be given the opportunity to learn about influential individuals including, Betty Campbell, Billy Boston and Shirley Bassey. Professionals in the field of education know that words are powerful and can mean the difference between success and failure. Despite being told as a young girl that achieving her dream of becoming a teacher "would be insurmountable", Betty Campbell wasn't deterred and overcame many barriers to become the first black head teacher in Wales during the 1970s[50]. Fortunately, Betty was strong enough when faced with adversity to achieve the opposite of what she was told her abilities were. Sadly, there are thousands of young people who lack the confidence to confront stereotypes passed down from generation to generation. We need to move past the history of slavery and lasting consequences of the period and instead challenge the ways in which black history should be remembered and celebrated; as well as how it influences and shapes Welsh culture today. Not only would black history start to be received in a positive perspective, it would present the opportunity to discuss controversial issues[51] such as hate or fear based on ethnic or religious difference, furthermore breaking down barriers built by past generations.

Under the 2010 Equality Act, schools must promote the spiritual, moral, social and cultural development of pupils. With the participation from our leaders and effective legislative action we can overcome the inequalities we are seeing in our societies and within our educational and state institutions. We can diminish and overcome the hate crime, racism, Islamophobia, homophobia and anti-immigration actions blighting our multicultural and diverse societies and we can create a more equal, accepting and inclusive Wales.

Contact: Uzo Iwobi uzo@racecouncilcymru.org.uk

Website: www.racecouncilcymru.org.uk

Section Five: Concluding Recommendations:

This paper has sought to present an up-to-date picture of the experiences of BAME pupils in schools in Wales from across Wales, drawing on the expertise of key charities in Wales working with BAME young people, including Gypsy Traveller Young people.

The voices of BAME Young people foregrounded within this document express loud and clear that for a significant proportion of the growing number of BAME pupils in Wales, the experience of racism is an everyday almost normalised one with lasting and damaging impact. These voices also bring into sharp focus the critical role of schools and teachers in how they respond to racism, with this response found to be severely lacking on the whole, compounded by a lack of BAME teachers, particularly at senior levels in Wales. Also illuminated is the way in which a 'white-washed' curriculum distorts both the BAME pupils' sense of self-worth as well as their own and their white peers' understanding of their place and value in the world.

To respond to these issues we therefore make the following recommendations of Welsh Government and other public sector policy-makers in Wales:

1. Prevent and challenge racist attitudes by embedding in the new curriculum specific requirements for regular anti-racist education throughout key stages and monitor this via the schools inspection framework (ESTYN).
2. Improve the monitoring and reporting of racist incidents and bullying in schools by making this a mandatory requirement, as recommended by Children's Commissioner and EHRC Wales.
3. Address the lack of BAME teachers, particularly at senior level by promoting the recruitment, retention and progression of BAME educators as well as BAME policy makers within the Education Sector.
4. Develop an authentically diverse curriculum that involves engagement with pupils and community in its creation and is embedded across the curriculum. The ongoing redevelopment of Wales' curriculum after the Donaldson Review presents a unique opportunity to action these changes.
5. Include BAME people and students in the current re-design of the curriculum and set specific targets for representation of non-White histories and cultures;
6. Work with the Education Workforce Council and other providers of teacher training and CPD to ensure that teachers are trained in a) cultural competence, the skills to reflect on their own identity and privilege and how that may affect pupils; b) to recognise and respond effectively to racism and c) to development authentic diversity in curriculums;
7. Introduce concerted and systematic programmes to raise the attainment of Gypsy, Traveller, Roma, and Black and Mixed Ethnicity groups that have historically suffered the lowest attainment, along with the continuation of programmes targeted at BAME groups more widely.
8. Ensure rigorous monitoring of the benefits of the support for ethnic minority and GRT pupils and monitor how transfer of previous targeted funding to general education funds affects pupil engagement and performance.
9. Find examples of best practices in how schools respond to racist incidents and teach pupils about race in Wales and replicate them.

Endnotes

[1] Race R and Lander V, *Advancing Race & Ethnicity in Education,* Palgrave MacMillan:2017.

[2] See Crenshaw, Kimberlé; Gotanda, Neil; Peller, Gary; Thomas, Kendall, eds. (1995). Critical Race Theory: The Key Writings that Formed the Movement. New York: The New Press. ISBN 978-1-56584-271-7

[3] https://statswales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Education-and-Skills/Schools-and-Teachers/Schools-Census/Pupil-Level-Annual-School-Census/Ethnicity-National-Identity-and-Language/pupilsaged5andiover-by-localauthorityregion-ethnicity

[4] Lewis & Starkey (2014) *Ethnic Minority Pupils: Evidence Review & Practice In Wales*, p. 15, http://gov.wales/docs/caecd/research/2014/140610-ethnic-minority-pupils-en.pdf

[5] Nicholl, Jones & Holtom, *Breaking the Links Between Poverty & Ethnicity in Wales*, Joseph Rowntree Foundation:2016

[6] StatsWales dataset https://statswales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Education-and-Skills/Post-16-Education-and-Training/Higher-Education/Initial-Teacher-Training-ITT/students-in-Wales/firstyearsonitecoursesinwales-by-ethnicity-year

[7] BBC Wales 17 June 2017

[8] Show Racism the Red Card Wales, "Racism and anti-racism in the Welsh education system," 2017

[9] Lander V, "Initial Teacher Education: The Practice of Whiteness,"p.99, In Ed Race R and Lander V, *Advancing Race & Ethnicity in Education,* Palgrave MacMillan:2017

[10] Interestingly, the young people al used the same language "joke" rather than the word "banter" often used by teachers.

[11] There was no familiar youth worker facilitating that group, however, so it is unclear to what degree the kids felt opening up in that context.

[12] They also learned "just a bit" about Asian history in WWII.

[13] Race R, "Analysing Ethnic Education Policy Making in England and Wales," p.22.

[14] Brentnall J, "Promoting engagement and academic achievement for Black and Mixed ethnicity pupils in Wales, February 2017.

[15] Ibid.

[16] Bradbury A, "Identity Performance and Race: The Use of Critical Race Theory in Understanding Institutional Racism and Discrimination in Schools," p. 24, In Ed. Race R and Lander V *Advancing Race and Ethnicity in Education,* Palgrave Macmillan: 2016

[17] Lewis & Starkey (2014) *Ethnic Minority Pupils: Evidence Review & Practice In Wales*, p. 15, http://gov.wales/docs/caecd/research/2014/140610-ethnic-minority-pupils-en.pdf

[18] Gillborn D "Education Policy as an Act of White Supremacy: Whiteness, Critical Race Theory and Education Reform," p. 17-18.

[19] Brentnall J, "Promoting engagement and academic achievement for Black and Mixed ethnicity pupils in Wales, February 2017.

[20] Ibid.

[21] Ibid.

[22] Lander V, "Initial Teacher Education: The Practice of Whiteness,"p.94, In Ed Race R and Lander V, *Advancing Race & Ethnicity in Education,* Palgrave MacMillan:2017

[23] Lewis & Starkey, *Ethnic Minority Pupils: Evidence Review & Practice In Wales. Welsh Government:2014.* http://gov.wales/docs/caecd/research/2014/140610-ethnic-minority-pupils-en.pdf.

[24] Statistical first release: Academic Achievement by Pupil Characteristic, Welsh Government 2017

[25] Nicholl, Jones & Holtom, *Breaking the Links Between Poverty & Ethnicity in Wales*, p. 16, Joseph Rowntree Foundation:2016

[26] 5 CGSE with A-C grades, including Math and English

[27] Welsh Government Wellbeing Review 2017:32

[28] Gilbourn D, "The Monsterisation of Race Equality: How Hate Became Honourable," In *The School Report*, p. 7, Runnymede:2015

[29] Burgess, Simon "Aspirations, Language and Poverty: Attainment and Ethnicity," In *The School Report*, Runnymede:2015

[30] EALAW "The Achievement of Ethnic Minority Pupils in Wales: A Report for the Welsh Assembly Government", 2003

[31] Ibid.

[32] Response by the Welsh Government to the report of the Children, Young People and Education Committee entitled Inquiry report into the Education Improvement Grant: Gypsy, Roma and Traveller, and Minority Ethnic Children. 2016. http://www.assembly.wales/laid%20documents/gen-ld11030/gen-ld11030-e.pdf

[33] Brentnall J, "Promoting Engagement and Academic Achievement for Black and Mixed Ethnicity Pupils in Wales, February 2017.

[34] Southern A, "Evidence Briefing: Ethnicity and Educational Attainment in Wales," Wales Centre for Equity in Education:2015

[35] Ibid.

[36] Brentnall J, "Consultation Education Improvement Grant: Gypsy, Roma and Traveller and Minority Ethnic Children" 2016

[37] Ibid.

[38] CF: EALAW "The Achievement of Ethnic Minority Pupils in Wales: A Report for the Welsh Assembly Government", 2003;   Longitudinal Study of Young People in England (LSYPE); and Wilson, A "I Just Want to Get Good Grades: Exploring BAME Young People's School Experiences - Discussions of success and advice for teachers and parents."

[39] Gilbourn D, "The Monsterisation of Race Equality: How Hate Became Honourable," In *The School Report*, p. 4, Runnymede:2015

[40] Yaojun L, "Ethnic Education and Labour Market Position in Britain (1972–2013)," In *The School Report*, p. 23 Runnymede:2015

[41] Brentnall J, "Promoting Engagement and Academic Achievement for Black and Mixed Ethnicity Pupils in Wales, February 2017.

[42] Ibid.

[43] Romani Gypsies (originally of Northern Indian descent and also known as English, Welsh and Scottish Gypsies, Kale and Romanichal); Welsh Travellers; Scottish Travellers; Irish Travellers; Roma/Sinti; Bargees or Boat Dwellers/Water Gypsies; Fairground or Show People; New Travellers. Romani Gypsies and Irish Travellers are recognised racial groups under Equality Act 2010.

[44] Table 8: Key Stage 4 by ethnic background, 2013-2015 (aggregated) (a) Stats Wales, aggregated data for 2013-15 showed only 15.5% of Gypsy/Gypsy Roma pupils achieved the Level 2 threshold (including a GCSE grade A*-C in English or Welsh First Language and Mathematics) – no data recorded for Irish Traveller children

[45] Wales National Attendance Codes: Code 'T' is used by schools to record authorised 'Traveller absence' i.e. absence for travelling for work purposes and for significant cultural or family events notified to schools may be regarded as authorised absence. Gypsy and Traveller parents will not be prosecuted for poor attendance where a pupil has attended for 200 sessions in the preceding year and absence has been authorised for work or cultural events.(Moving Forward Guidance)

[46] Good Practice in Education Report 2015 Travelling Ahead http://www.travellingahead.org.uk/projects/education/

[47] Race Council Cymru, *A Report on Race Equality and Racism in Wales An Exploratory Study* (2012), https://drive.google.com/file/d/1h63gd4YYVqq311wcV5BiR_QP9kPdaQTFpJvh107EELtOe4KqK4DITq4VNyidDVlGyEUsJdwMYaXVzyXp/view

[48] BBC News (24 June 2016), *Welsh voters back Leave in EU poll*, http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-politics-eu-referendum-36612308

[49] Welsh Government, *Getting On Together - a Community Cohesion Strategy for Wales* (Last updated 27 April 2012), http://gov.wales/topics/people-and-communities/communities/communitycohesion/publications/strategy/?lang=en

[50] National Assembly for Wales, Assembly blog (6 August 2016), *Betty Campbell MBE addresses Assembly staff as part of Diversity and Inclusion week*, https://assemblyblog.wales/2016/08/16/betty-campbell-mbe-addresses-assembly-staff-as-part-of-diversity-and-inclusion-week/

[51] Welsh Government, Asylum seekers and refugees Delivery Plan, *Refugee and Asylum Seeker Delivery Plan* (Last updated 12 September 2017), http://gov.wales/topics/people-and-communities/communities/communitycohesion/asylum-seekers-and-refugees/?lang=en

www.eyst.org.uk